



7TH WINTER SCHOOL
ECONOMICS OF COMPETITION LAW
THE VIRTUAL EDITION
15TH - 26TH NOVEMBER 2021

REPORT

CUTS Institute for Regulation & Competition (CIRC)
Flat- 5, House No. 658, Lane- 4, Westend Marg, Saidulajab, New Delhi-110 030, India
Web: www.circ.in Email: circ@circ.in

Global experts and participants



India



France



Canada



United States of America



Germany



Barbados



Mauritius



Nigeria



Fiji



Kenya



Malaysia

Objective of the Winter School

Over the past few years, as markets have become increasingly global as well as digital, the approaches to regulate them have leaned more heavily on economics. Modern competition law differs from traditional competition law in that it reflects the economic dimensions of analysing market structures and behaviour on account of innovation and market dynamism. Furthermore, the basic character of modern competition laws has shifted from size to conduct. Unlike many other laws, competition law straddles law and economics. The same principle also applies in other commercial laws but in competition law, the relationship is much deeper. Competition law must be applied on a ‘rule of reason’ approach rather than a straightforward ‘rule of law’ approach. Thus, regulatory and competition authorities have moved to adopt more economics-based approaches in assessing business practices and anti-competitive behaviour. It is critical to understand these nuances to help better understand the bigger picture and thus adjudicate competition cases.

The goal of CIRC’s Winter School on Economics of Competition Law is to familiarise participants with economic literature in the field of competition law and equip them to use the economic analysis tools and methods used around the world. Lately, contemporary issues such as algorithmic collusions, privacy, killer acquisitions and regulatory overlaps are arising all over the world. Competition authorities are grappling with the complexities of digital markets. The literature on these issues is a work in progress and there is no consensus on these yet. CIRC focused the seventh Winter School on these themes by bringing distinguished speakers researching and working on these themes to share their knowledge, experience and ongoing research with the participants.

The training programme is intended for competition lawyers, academics, professionals, corporate and legal consultants, staff of competition authorities and students. To this end, on 15-26 November 2021, CIRC organised the seventh edition of its ten-day Winter School on Economics of Competition Law virtually.

Structure and Pedagogy

The first five editions of the Winter School were conducted in a physical setting; however, due to Covid-19 pandemic restrictions, the event was conducted virtually last year as well as this year over a period of ten days with two-hour sessions each day. Secondly, by spreading out the course over 10 days also helped in getting more participants, both from domestic areas and internationally.

The theme of this year's edition was contemporary issues in competition legislation, reflecting emerging issues in the field. The topics covered in different sessions ranged from definition of consumer welfare, killer acquisitions, blockchain technology, privacy concerns, healthcare policy, collective dominance, competition concerns in healthcare, international cooperation, sectoral enforcement v. competition regulator to the interplay between intellectual property rights and competition law.

The pedagogy involves theory as well as case laws for all the topics through presentations, discussions and graphical representations. They were insightful, interactive and intellectually stimulating. Many interesting discussions and question-answer rounds took place during the sessions. Background reading material and presentations for all the sessions were circulated amongst the participants.

After completion of the training, certificates of participation were issued to the participants and they were asked to fill in a feedback form to give an assessment of all the sessions and faculty. A summary of the feedback is provided in Annexure IV.

Faculty and Participants

The virtual mode enabled us to bring several global experts together in this event, making it a one-of-a-kind learning experience for the participants. The faculty included the following experts from the field (See Annexure III for speakers' profile):

- 1) Eleanor M. Fox, Professor, New York University of Law
- 2) Gregory J. Werden, former Senior Economic Counsel in the Antitrust Division of the US Department of Justice
- 3) Steve Salop, Professor, Georgetown University Law Center
- 4) Joseph Wilson, Professor, McGill University and former Chairman, Competition Commission of Pakistan
- 5) Payal Malik, Adviser (Economics) and Head, Economics Division, Competition Commission of India (CCI)
- 6) Geeta Gouri, former Member, CCI
- 7) James Mancini, Competition Expert, OECD
- 8) Giovanna Massarotto, Academic Fellow, CITC, University of Pennsylvania

- 9) Aline Blankertz, Senior Consultant, Oxera
- 10) Ujjwal Kumar, Policy Analyst, CUTS and Deputy Head, CUTS CCIER
- 11) Garima Sodhi, Senior Policy Analyst, CIRC

Garima Sodhi, Senior Policy Analyst, CIRC was also the Course Director of the training programme and Bhaavi Agrawal, Research Associate, CIRC was the programme coordinator.

We had the pleasure of hosting participants from Fiji, Malaysia, Mauritius, Nigeria, Barbados, Kenya and India. The participants were a focused group consisting of seventeen representatives from national competition authorities of international jurisdictions, four from international law firms, four from corporate firms and six law students.

Day 1: Inaugural Session

The Inaugural Session was graced by Dr Arvind Mayaram, Chairman, CUTS Institute for Regulation and Competition, former Finance Secretary (Government of India), and Mr. Pradeep S. Mehta, Secretary General, Consumer Unity & Trust Society (CUTS International) and Founding Board Member, CIRC. Ms. Sodhi welcomed the participants and briefed them about CIRC and the virtual training programme.

Dr Mayaram welcomed the participants and talked about the shifting perspectives towards competition enforcement due to the economy's changing structure and dynamics. He also discussed the importance of regulation of the ever-growing digital market, which witnessed a boom in the wake of the pandemic-induced lockdown and the need for developing modern competition tools to correctly ascertain and capture competition offences in the digital landscape.

In his keynote speech, Mr Mehta highlighted the objective of competition law and its role in the healthy functioning of markets. He also briefly spoke about the effects of the pandemic on Competition Law. He further expounded upon the evolution of competition law in the world. He illustrated that such laws were formulated in 1889 in Canada and in 1890 in the US in response to agrarian interests and explained how they stand today. He added that when the WTO agreement was signed in 1994, only about 35 countries had competition laws. Today the number has crossed 140 and counting. He cited the need for further evolution of competition enforcement to adapt to rapidly changing times, and particularly on global cooperation in view of increasing cross-border trade. He concluded his presentation by welcoming all the participants to the training programme.

Session 1: Consumer welfare definition – Steven Salop

The first session of the ten-day virtual Winter School was delivered by Prof. Steven Salop on the definition of consumer welfare from the lens of competition law. He discussed various approaches like traditional school, Chicago School, Post Chicago and Neo-Brandeisians when analysing the definition of consumer welfare. He expounded on the impact of consumer welfare vis-à-vis the total welfare standard on cases where a merger leads to cost-saving effectiveness. He stated that due to the dead weight loss in supply, consumers are harmed and welfare reduces as a result of price rise. Prof. Salop also brought out the political undertones behind the design of the definition under the Sherman Act. The session was concluded by emphasising the need for exhibiting welfare philosophy and ideology in competition regulation and not circumscribing the scope of the general welfare definition by placing reliance on the enforcement standard.

Session 2: Killer Acquisition, Innovation and Startup Ecosystem – James Mancini

The second session had James Mancini talking about killer acquisitions, innovation and startup ecosystems in competitive marketplaces. He started the presentation with a discussion about the ill-effects of concentrated market power in the digital landscape such as rising markups, growing concentration of income at the sectoral level and decline in startup creation. He contrasted the traditional sources of market power such as economies of scale, economies of scope and network effects to newer sources such as data and data feedback loops. He highlighted the characteristics of digital market which have the capacity to disrupt fair competition: network effects, economies of scale, data collection, vertical integration, non-price competition and zero prices. He further discussed the absence of concrete definition of privacy due to the lack of consumer awareness and the privacy paradox. In the end, he elucidated upon the prevalence of dynamic competition due to the presence of startups and innovation and the need to have market contestability.

Session 3: Privacy and Competition – Aline Blankertz

Aline Blankertz deliberated upon the paradigm of privacy and competition. The session highlighted the theories of harm, prevalent regulatory intervention in relation to privacy concerns and competition regimes. She raised pertinent questions regarding what would constitute private and sensitive data as differentiated from co-produced data and collective data. The rising

interaction between the two signifies that though there is a practice to share data, governing statutes are not clear. Using Facebook as an illustration, she depicted the deterioration in the quality of privacy policies. She ended the session by deliberating upon the strategies that could synthesise privacy concerns in competition enforcement.

Session 4: Collective Dominance – Geeta Gouri

Dr Geeta Gouri, who was a Member of the Competition Commission of India, highlighted the notions of collective dominance and produced instances and experience from Indian jurisdiction. She discussed the economic tools of analysis in relation to oligopolistic markets – Stackelberg model of imperfect competition (leader-follower model), prisoner’s dilemma and Nash’s equilibrium and the Bertrand model on price fixing. She provided deep insights into Sections 03 and 04 of the Indian Competition Act using the cement cartel case, drugs pharma association case, etc. The session concluded with newer nuances of collective dominance as exhibited in the platform markets.

Session 5: Algorithms and Collusion – Payal Malik

In this session, Payal Malik discussed Algorithms and Collusion and their interface with competition law. She discussed the various types of algorithms and their role (monitoring, parallel, signaling and self-learning algorithms) with respect to vertical and horizontal context. She focused on the application of the traditional antitrust concepts to algorithms such as deep learning algorithms and imposition of liability for the programme, programmer and the firm. She delved into the relationship of oligopoly and the marketplace leading the overt, tacit collusion, conscious paradigm and non-conscious paradigm as prices are adjusted due to market forces. The session was concluded by highlighting the need to have an effective and efficient policy. It also identified roadblocks like absence of technical know-how to analyses such algorithms.

Session 6: Blockchain and Competition – Giovanna Massarotto

The sixth session by Giovanna Massarotto took up the topic of blockchain and competition enforcement. She started with the basics of blockchain – private (hyperledger), public (bitcoin) and permissioned blockchain (ripple). She expounded upon the possible effect of smart contracts on the legal enforcement of contractual rights. Taking Google search engine as an illustration, she

discussed its free use for users and the mode of earning from advertisements. She elaborated on data driven markets wherein pricing is no longer a factor for competition and network effects are the driving competitive force of the marketplace. The session ended with deliberations upon whether blockchain can be the organic solution to restore internet decentralisation. The session emphasised the potential that smart contracts carry as they can be auto enforced and facilitate digital competition.

Session 7: Intellectual Property and Competition Law – Gregory Werden

The seventh session was on the interplay of intellectual property and competition law. Dr Gregory Warden kickstarted the session by elaborating on the basic economics of information and the social value therein. He discussed how information creators are rewarded by patent rights that carry the promise of market power. He then contrasted the different approaches of two major jurisdictions: the US and EU. Referring to patent pools that reduce cost and royalties and the other that sought to eliminate competition, he discussed the case of FTC v. Qualcomm and the vertical restrictions imposed such as exclusive licences.

Session 8: Sectoral Regulators v. Competition Agency – Eleanor Fox

The eighth session delivered by Eleanor Fox focused on sectoral regulation vis-à-vis the competition agency. The session covered not only the choice between competition regulation and free competition capped by competition law but also deliberated on the key distinguishing features between them. She discussed various factors governing the formation of regulatory agencies such as hybrid or stringent frameworks, over or under regulation, technical expertise over the matter, political leadership, etc. She discussed the case of AT&T in the US to showcase predatory pricing that was a consequence of the erstwhile regulations. She discussed how not only market failure may trigger a change in regulations but also how market failures may be a result of change in regulations. She concluded that optimum regulation required to control big tech is an ongoing discourse and semblance of jurisprudence on global level is required as the new digital markets go beyond geographical borders.

Session 9: International Cooperation in Competition Enforcement – Dr Joseph Wilson

The ninth session was on international cooperation in competition enforcement, Dr Joseph Wilson highlighted the need for international cooperation in the backdrop of globalisation and markets across borders. He presented case studies of a few transnational mergers where international cooperation reduced the efforts of competition authorities. He then spoke about the formation of International Competition Network (ICN) and the events that led to it. He discussed some features of the 1991 agreement between the EU and the US such as notification of enforcement activities that may affect each other's jurisdiction, exchange of information on current enforcement activities and economic sectors of interest. He also highlighted the challenges in executing such cooperation agreement due to the lack of legislative backing and soft nature of law. The multilateral efforts for international cooperation were discussed by virtue of the Havana Charter established prior to the WTO. The agreement was used to illustrate its importance in lieu of international cooperation as it provided asymmetric information, bilateral coordination, substantive convergence while highlighting the conflict of cooperation in competition law due to sovereignty concerns and thus the need for multilateral agreements for such cooperation and thereon dispute resolution.

Session 10: Competition Policy and Healthcare – Ujjwal Kumar and Garima Sodhi

In the last session of the Winter School, the role of competition policy in the healthcare sector was discussed. Ujjwal Kumar discussed the TRIPS agreement and its corresponding provisions in the Indian Patent Act. He discussed the flexibility granted for the purpose of socio-economic welfare and promotion of public interest through mechanisms like compulsory licences and non-compulsory licences. He made a reference to the Doha Declaration on TRIPS and Public Health 2001 to highlight the role of TRIPS agreement in the protection of public health. Against this backdrop, he also brought out the issues of data exclusivity in drug regulations, biologics, biosimilar, regulatory barriers and obligation of member states.

Garima Sodhi then discussed competition policy in the healthcare sector. As illustration, she took the help of CD Pharma case (Denmark) and Aspen case (Italy) on excessive pricing and the difference in the approaches of jurisdictions to deal with these anti-competitive practices. She also presented the AbbVie and Allergan merger to illustrate the role relevant market definition plays while ascertaining conduct that can impact competition. Lastly, she discussed the three fault lines in the healthcare sector as identified by the Competition Commission of India in its latest market

study on the pharmaceutical sector: branded v. unbranded, e-pharmacies v. brick-and-mortar and innovators v. imitators.

Valedictory

At the end of the tenth session, Garima Sodhi delivered the vote of thanks to the faculty and the participants on behalf of CIRC for collaborating and successfully leading the lectures in the seventh edition of the Winter School. The participants received temporary access to the recording of each session along with the presentations of the faculty. All the participants were issued certificates of participation after the successful completion of the training programme.

Annexure I: About the Organisers

CUTS Institute for Regulation & Competition (CIRC) was set up in 2008 by CUTS International (www.cuts-international.org). Since 1983, CUTS has been globally renowned as a non-government organisation working on rules-based trade, effective regulation and good governance. It has been responsible for the adoption and/or refinement of competition laws in over 30 developing countries.

This track record is the pedigree of CIRC, which is also a not-for-profit, independent research and capacity building organisation. It has been active in the areas of competition, regulation and sustainable infrastructure, including PPPs. It assists multilateral and bilateral government and private agencies in knowledge creation as well as strengthening capacity for achieving better outcomes in policy formulation and implementation in the projects they undertake.

The Institute aims to facilitate research to enhance understanding and explore inter-disciplinary linkages among the identified subjects. CIRC is striving hard in its endeavour to generate and disseminate knowledge on its thrust areas. Since its inception, CIRC has taken varied initiatives to impart knowledge and train various stakeholders on these areas with the aim to build capacity of these stakeholders, thus contributing to the economy in this knowledge-intensive era. For further details on our initiatives, please visit website: www.circ.in

Annexure II: Detailed Agenda

Economics of Competition Law – The virtual edition

Organised by CIRC

15–26 November 2021

Platform:

Zoom software

Course Coordinators:

Garima Sodhi

Senior Research Analyst, CIRC

Email ID: gms@circ.in

Bhaavi Agrawal

Research Associate, CIRC

Email ID: ba@circ.in

DATE	SESSION TIMING	TOPIC	SPEAKER
<i>15th November</i>	7:00 pm - 7:30 pm IST 1:30 pm - 2:00 pm GMT	Inaugural Session	Pradeep S. Mehta , Secretary General, CUTS International Arvind Mayaram , former Finance Secretary GoI and Chairman, CIRC
	7:30 - 9:45 pm IST 2:00 - 04:15 pm GMT	Consumer Welfare Definition	Steven Salop , Professor Georgetown Univ Law Center
<i>16th November</i>	3 - 5:15 pm IST 9:30 - 11:45 am GMT	Killer acquisitions, innovation and start-up ecosystem	James Mancini , Competition Expert, OECD
<i>17th November</i>	3 - 5:15 pm IST 9:30 - 11:45 am GMT	Privacy and Competition	Dr Aline Blankertz Senior Consultant, Oxera
<i>18th November</i>	3 - 5:15 pm IST 9:30 - 11:45 am GMT	Collective Dominance	Geeta Gouri , Former Member, Competition Commission of India
<i>19th November</i>	3 - 5:15 pm IST 9:30 - 11:45 am GMT	Algorithms and Collusion	Payal Malik , Economics Advisor and Head Economics Division, Competition Commission of India
<i>22nd November</i>	7:30 - 9:45 pm IST 2:00 - 4:15 pm GMT	Blockchain and Competition	Giovanna Massarotto Academic Fellow, CTIC, University of Pennsylvania
<i>23rd November</i>	7:30 - 9:45 pm IST 2:00 - 4:15 pm GMT	Intellectual Property and Competition Law	Gregory J. Werden Former Senior Economic Counsel Antitrust Division USA Department of Justice
<i>24th November</i>	8:30 - 10:45 pm IST 3:00 - 5:15 pm GMT	Sector regulators v. Competition Agency	Dr Eleanor Fox Professor, New York University School of Law
<i>2nd December</i>	4:30 pm - 6:45 pm IST 11:00 - 1:15 pm GMT	International Cooperation for Competition Enforcement	Dr Joseph Wilson Professor, McGill University and Former Chairman, Competition Commission of Pakistan

<i>3rd December</i>	3 - 5:15 pm IST 9:30 - 11:45 am GMT	Competition Policy and Access to Healthcare	Ujjwal Kumar Policy Analyst, CUTS and Deputy Head, CUTS CCIER Garima Sodhi Senior Policy Analyst, CIRC
--------------------------------	---	--	--

Annexure III: Speakers' Profile

Eleanor Fox

Professor, New York University School of Law



Eleanor M. Fox is the Walter J. Derenberg Professor of Trade Regulation at New York University School of Law. She is an expert in antitrust and competition policy, teaching, writing and advising on competition policy in nations around the world and in international organisations. She has a special interest in developing countries, poverty and inequality. She explores how opening markets and attacking privilege, corruption and cronyism can alleviate marginalisation and open paths to economic opportunity and inclusive development. Fox received her law degree from NYU School of Law in 1961; she received an honorary doctorate degree from the University of Paris-Dauphine in 2009. She was awarded an inaugural Lifetime Achievement Award in 2011 by the Global Competition Review for ‘substantial, lasting, and transformational impact on competition policy and practice’. She received the inaugural award for outstanding contributions to the international competition law community in 2015 by ASCOLA, the Academic Society for Competition Law. With Mor Bakhoun, she co-authored *Making Markets Work for Africa* (Oxford 2019); with Daniel Crane *Global Issues in Antitrust and Competition Law* (2d ed. West 2017), with Damien Gerard *EU Competition Law Casebook* (Elgar 2017) and with Dane Crane the casebook *US Antitrust Law in Global Context* (4d ed. West 2020).

Steven Salop

Professor, Georgetown Univ Law Center



Steven Salop is a Professor of Economics and Law at the Georgetown University Law Center in Washington, DC, where he teaches antitrust law and economics. His research and consulting focuses on antitrust, competition, and regulation. He has written numerous articles in various areas of antitrust and competition which take a modern ‘Post-Chicago’ approach. These include

articles that concern the role of decision theory in legal rulemaking, the antitrust welfare standard, raising rivals' costs and other forms of exclusionary conduct, mergers, joint ventures and facilitating practices ventures. Professor Salop earned a BA degree at University of Pennsylvania, Summa Cum Laude and an M.Phil. and Ph.D in Economics from Yale University.

Gregory J. Werden

Former Senior Economic Counsel, Antitrust Division of the US Department of Justice



Gregory J. Werden earned a Ph.D. in Economics in 1977 then began work at the Antitrust Division of the US Department of Justice. There he helped in the preparation of numerous sets of enforcement guidelines and over a hundred briefs filed in the appellate courts and the Supreme Court. He is the only Antitrust Division employee ever to receive the Department's Mary C. Lawton Lifetime Service Award. Throughout his years in government, he actively contributed to antitrust scholarship. Among the innovations he introduced were the hypothetical monopolist test for market delineation and merger simulation. After retirement in 2019, he wrote the book *The Foundations of Antitrust: Events, Ideas, and Doctrines* (Carolina Academic Press 2020).

Payal Malik

Economics Advisor and Head of the Economics Division at Competition Commission of India



Payal Malik is Adviser, Economics and Head of the Economics Division at the Competition Commission of India. She is on secondment from PGDAV College, University of Delhi, where she is an Associate Professor of Economics. Formerly, she was a visiting Senior Research Fellow, LIRNEasia. A senior economist on public policy, her areas of expertise are competition law, policy and regulation. She was on the team that drafted the Electricity Act of

India ushering competition into the sector. Previously, she was a senior consultant at the Centre for Infrastructure and Regulation, National Council of Applied Economic Research (NCAER), India. She is also a member of the Governing Council of the CUTS Institute for Regulation and Competition. She has a B.A. (Hons) in Economics from Lady Shri Ram College, University of Delhi and an M.A. and M.Phil. in Economics from the Delhi School of Economics. She also has an M.B.A. in finance from the University of Cincinnati, Ohio, USA.

Geeta Gouri

Former Member, Competition Commission of India



Dr Geeta Gouri, former Member of the CCI, is an economist with 15 years of experience working as a regulatory economist. She served as Member (Economics) at the CCI for 5 years and prior to that as Director (Tariffs) at the Andhra Pradesh Electricity Regulatory Commission. This unique experience gives her the privilege of being perhaps the only economist in India to be associated with the premiering of the two commissions, which ushered competition and markets reforms in the economy. Dr Gouri has published extensively and delivered lectures on a wide range of subjects: Pricing for Welfare; Petroleum Products in India; Privatisation and Public Enterprise: The Asia-Pacific Experience; Towards Equity: New Economic Policy and Equity.

Joseph Wilson

Professor, McGill University and Former Chairman, Competition Commission of Pakistan



Dr Joseph Wilson is a former Chairman and founding Commissioner of the Competition Commission of Pakistan, where he served from November 2007 to November 2016. Dr Wilson is an adjunct Professor at McGill University's Faculty of Law, where he teaches International Competition Law, among other courses, and is an independent consultant in competition matters. Earlier, Dr Wilson served as an Associate Professor of Law at the Lahore

University of Management Sciences (LUMS), Pakistan, where he helped set up its law school. He earned Doctor of Civil Law (D.C.L.) with Dean's Honours List and Master of Laws (LL.M.) degrees from McGill University, and another LL.M. from the University of Georgia, USA. He is a member of the State Bar of New York and Lahore High Court Bar. He serves on the International Advisory Board of the Loyola University Chicago's Institute for Consumer Antitrust Studies. He has authored a number law journal articles, book chapters, judicial opinions and a book titled *Globalization and the Limits of National Merger Control Laws*.

Giovanna Massarotto

Academic Fellow, CTIC, University of Pennsylvania



Dr Giovanna Massarotto is Academic Fellow at the Center for Technology Innovation and Competition (CTIC) at University of Pennsylvania. Her research focuses on antitrust issues as they are related to technologies, with a concentration on blockchain and AI. She is an active scholar who has published a book with Wolters Kluwer and papers in many prestigious journals including the *Journal of Competition Law & Economics* and the Stanford Computational Antitrust. She has been a speaker at the OECD Blockchain Policy Forum and invited to present by several institutions internationally, including the Competition and Markets Authority (CMA), the University of Oxford, the Stanford Center for Legal Informatics-Codex and the Global Antitrust Institute (GAI) in Washington D.C. She also taught at Bocconi University and University of Iowa as an Adjunct Professor. She was also Academic Visitor at the University of Oxford and ran and taught a programme on blockchain for the UCL Center for Blockchain Technology (UCL CBT).

James Mancini

Competition Expert, OECD



James Mancini is a competition expert in the OECD's Directorate for Financial and Enterprise Affairs. He conducts research to support the work of the OECD Competition Committee with a particular emphasis on digital competition issues, and contributes to capacity-building efforts for competition authorities. Before joining the OECD, James held consulting roles at PricewaterhouseCoopers as well as NERA Economic Consulting. In these positions, he prepared economic expert reports for antitrust and securities litigation, including damage quantification and class certification matters, as well as policy impact assessments for several governments. Prior to these roles, James was an economist in the Canadian government's Department of Finance, where he provided advice on securities regulation in the wake of the financial crisis. James has also worked in the office of a Minister in the Canadian federal government and a utilities regulator. James obtained a Master's degree in Economics from the London School of Economics.

Aline Blankertz

Senior Consultant, Oxera



Aline Blankertz is an applied economist with ample experience in analysing and developing policies for digital markets. She has worked for the economics consultancy Oxera and the digital policy think tank Stiftung Neue Verantwortung, where she has focused on the intersection of data privacy and competition, data trusts, impact of the platform economy, algorithms and fairness in e-commerce. She has served as an expert in parliaments and taught courses for EU judges on competition in digital markets. Besides, she is co-founder and co-chairwoman of SINE Foundation that promotes confidential data sharing.

Ujjwal Kumar

Policy Analyst, CUTS and Deputy Head, CUTS CCIER



Ujjwal Kumar is a law graduate from University of Delhi and has been trained in law/policy issues related with multilateral trading system, intellectual property and competition, among other things. His first exposure on these issues came at CUTS International, Jaipur, where he joined as a researcher in 1999. He developed basic understanding of the multilateral trading system under and also got exposure in competition law/policy issues. In 2001, Ujjwal joined the Gene Campaign, New Delhi as Policy Analyst, where he developed an understanding of law and politics vis-à-vis IP & bio-resources, agriculture, traditional knowledge and regulation of Genetically Modified Organisms.

Garima Sodhi

Senior Fellow, CIRC



Garima Sodhi is a Senior Policy Analyst at CUTS Institute for Regulation & Competition (CIRC), New Delhi, and leads its Competition & Regulation vertical. She has previously worked at Competition Commission of India in economics division as well as investigation division as an Economics Expert. Prior to joining CIRC, she has worked at ICF International (ICFI) in energy consulting for North American and Indian markets. She has extensive experience in research and consulting in the areas of competition economics, public policy, intellectual property and energy economics. She holds a Master's in Economics (with specialisation in environment and resource economics) from TERI University, New Delhi, and a B.A. (Hons) Economics from College of Vocational Studies, Delhi University.

Annexure IV: Feedback and Suggestions

The course received a good response from the participants and suggestions of conducting more trainings/workshops on similar topics. Table 1 below summarises the ratings given for each session.

Table 1: Session Feedback

	Session	Excellent	Very Good	Good	Average	Poor	No Response
1	Consumer Welfare Definition (Steven Salop)	39.2%	42.8%	10.7%	7.1%	-	-
2	Killer acquisitions innovation and start-up ecosystem (James Mancini)	42.8%	39.2%	17.8%	-	-	-
3	Privacy and Competition (Aline Blankertz)	53.5%	25%	21.4%	-	-	-
4	Collective Dominance (Geeta Gouri)	46.4%	32.1%	21.4%	-	-	-
5	Algorithms and Collusion (Payal Malik)	50%	25%	21.4%	-	-	-
6	Blockchain and Competition (Giovanna Massarotto)	42.8%	39.2%	17.8%	-	-	-
7	Intellectual Property and Competition Law (Gregory J. Werden)	35.7%	46.4%	10.7%	7.1%	-	-
8	Sector regulators v. Competition Agency (Eleanor Fox)	50%	32.1%	17.8%	-	-	-
9	International Cooperation for Competition Enforcement (Joseph Wilson)	46.4%	32.1%	21.4%	-	-	-
10	Competition Policy and Access to	46.4%	25%	25%	3.5%	-	-

Healthcare (Ujjwal Kumar and Garima Sodhi)						
The columns indicate number of participants who gave the corresponding ratings to the respective issues, total number of participants who filled the feedback form.						

The participants found the course helpful in their profession and were satisfied with the learning on Competition Law and assessment tools that help in detecting anti-competitive elements. Table 2 shows the general review of the Winter School shared by the participants.

Table 2. General Review

	Excellent	Very Good	Good	Average	Poor	No Response
Appropriateness of the course and contents	39.2 %	42.8 %	14.2 %	3.5 %	-	-
Organisation of the course	35.7 %	35.7 %	28.5 %	-	-	-
Speaker(s)	42.8 %	42.8 %	14.2%	-	-	-
Quality of course material	35.7 %	42.8 %	17.8 %	3.5 %	-	-
Effectiveness of audio/visual	39.2 %	39.2 %	21.4 %	-	-	-
Classroom interaction	14.2 %	35.7 %	39.2 %	10.7 %	-	-
Overall evaluation of course	42.8 %	39.2 %	14.2 %	3.5 %	-	-

